# Family Law – Marriage and Guardianship

#### -Roshan Dalvi

# A happy marriage

### is the union of

two forgivers

### Ambit of Family Law



# Legislations

- Constitution of India Arts. 39, 45
- United Nations Covenant on Rights of the Child
- Indian Divorce Act, 1869 S. 41
- Guardian and Wards Act, 1890 Ss. 7, 17
- Parsee Marriage and Divorce Act, 1936 S. 49
- Dissolution of Muslim Marriages Act, 1939/2019
- Special Marriage Act, 1954 S. 38
- Hindu Marriage Act, 1956 S. 26
- Hindu Minority and Guardianship Act, 1956–S.6
- Juvenile Justice Act, 2015 Ss. 2 (9) and (14)

# Objects of Family Law

□ To promote conciliation / settlement

□ To resolve disputes promptly

Wide belief is that the FCs show a harming, not a healing process. Need for organizations outside the FC system to deal with litigants gently without making FCs extinct

# Agencies for realizing the objects

NGOs for Social and Family Welfare – S. 5

- Marriage and Child Counsellors (for interview and advise) (e.g. Muskaan, TISS)
- NGOs for Women Empowerment (e.g. SEWA, Swayam Siddha)
- Lawyers' NGOs for Women Protection (e.g. Majlis, Lawyers' Collective)
- Bar Initiatives (e.g. Sensitization of custodial and Noncustodial parents, films - voice of child who went through Court to help children who have to go through court)

# Agencies for realizing the objects

Medical and Welfare Experts – S. 12

- ➢Psychologists
- ➢Psychiatrists
- Experts in Social Work (MSW)
- ➢College Initiatives
- Mediators / Pre-litigation Mediation
- ≻Child Independent Lawyers (CIL)
- Legal Expert as *amicus Curiae* (S. 13)
- Social Service Unit in Israel

### Evidence

#### Oral and Documentary

No usage of the Evidence Act (S. 14) but basic principles to be followed

Oral evidence – affidavit of evidence /

pleadings, Cross examination (O. 18 r 4 CPC)

Only a memorandum (S. 15)

Formal evidence on affidavit, but summoning the witness if required (S. 16)

Documentary evidence – e.g. rent receipts, salary slips, electricity bills in bulk

## Decree / Order

Executable under the CPC (S.18)

- $\checkmark$  Monetary decree by attachment and arrest
- ✓ Declaratory decree by possession or eviction
- ✓ Other orders e.g. if the maintenance is not paid for 3 months, deduction from salary by the employer

Areas of Work

- Dissolution and continuance of Marriage
- Injunctions
- Maintenance and alimony
- Custody / care and contact with children
- Stridhan
- Others

# Way of Work for the Parties

<u>Collaborative, not competitive</u> Involving:

- Client Counselling
- Negotiation and Facilitation } POS
- Mediation and Conciliation }





# **Domestic Relationships**

- Husband and wife
- Live-in Partners
- Parents and Children
- Relatives
- Adoptive family
- Joint family members

# Types of Cruelty

- Physical
- Mental
- Emotional
- Psychological
- Economic
- Social
- Sexual

# **Contribution of Counsellors**

- Professional approach
- Home study timely intervention
- Lawyer Counsellor partnership
- Meeting with the Judge / Lawyer / Child / Parents

# Activities of Counsellors of Family Courts IN COURTS

- Group Counselling custodial parents and non-custodial parents
- CCTV
- Home study
- Painting, elocution, debating, essay writing competitions
- Children's Day
- Father's Day
- Mother's Day
- Record, Recognise, Report, Reconcile
- Reconciled couples to share experiences

#### **Activities of Counsellors of Family Courts**

#### **IN CHAMBERS**

- Mediation techniques
- Communication skills
- College students / young lawyers as interns of counsellors and judges
- Guest sessions of NGOs
- Counselling advocates if amenable to settlement
- Awareness programmes for litigants, college students etc.
- Client counselling

# FAMILY

Father And Mother Ι Love You

Children are little people

# Who need big rights

- Dr. Klaus Kankel

#### **FamilyTherapy:**

- 1. Parent counselling "our child" not "my child"
- 2. Joint custody shared parenting
  - Child needs both, therefore, joint parenting plan

**Clinical Psychology** 

3. Quality time – purposeful access

## Children need our presence not our presents

# Untied 뒷 United



# TEAM =

# Together Each Achieves More



# Child's Rights

- Right to Justice, Liberty, Equality
- Right to a Family
- Right to get the best of both the parents and all the family members
- Right to maintain contact with all
- Right to be like all peers / friends

The perspective of the child, not the parents

# Way of Work for the Children

Amiable, not Argumentative

- Interview the child
- Work out the access/contact
- Awareness Creation of Joint Parenting in the client – Parenting Plan

#### Tug-of-Peace, not Tug-of-War

# Aspects of Custody

- Rights / Duties
- Parenting Plan
- Joint Custody
- Child Interview
- Child Counsellors
- Negotiation / Facilitation
- Mediation / Conciliation
- Child Independent Lawyer

# Definition

Joint Custody refers to:

- Shared physical custody with children spending equal or substantial amounts of time with both parents
- Shared legal custody with primary residence being with one parent
- Joint physical custody implies ongoing close contact with both parents
- Joint legal custody implies shared decision making by both parents



#### **Shared parenting**

- Joint physical/legal custody (as Legal, Rebuttable Standard Presumption)
  - Shared authority
  - Joint responsibility

INTERNATIONAL HUMAN AND CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS UN CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD

#### Joint Custody

→ when both parents are equally placed
→ when both parents are good and cultured
→ draw up a parenting plan
→ give guidelines for access and custody



- See child needs home study report
- Assess child wants child opinion :
   →Child welfare →Child wishes
- Purposeful access –
   →quality time → parental responsibility
- Physical, mental, social counselling
- Counsel parents no winning over by gifts
- Monthly meetings when professional help is required to assess short term effects

# Child Access

- Why?
  - Child needs both parents
- Where ?
  - At a congenial venue
  - Ultimately at home
- How ?
  - By discussion, counseling, deliberation, agreement with parties
  - Interview of child ?
  - The whole range of access to be worked out at one time.
  - Yet, it is a temporary arrangement, amenable to change.
  - without recording evidence
- How much ?
  - Variable depending upon the age, time, circumstances, child's needs and time - depending upon which parent is the primary care taker
- When ?
  - After the non-custodial parent deserves what he desires
  - If the custodial parent persistently defaults / disobeys

# Parenting Plan - Imperative

- To be submitted along with the Petition for custody
- Stability in access dates known
- Parents can plan in advance
- Child knows what is to be expected
- Fewer applications
- Saving in judicial time

Parent privilege has autonomy. Hence, Court is a therapeutic body

# Factors for Parenting Plan

- Time / Place
- School activities
- Access to school records ? PTA / Progress
- School calendar
- Vacations / Festivals / Extended family
- Birthdays (English Indian calendars)
- Medical Insurance
- Contact info / Video audio calls
- Transportation

# Types of Parenting

- Co-operative Parenting Best for the child
- Parallel Parenting Also good, adaptive
- Single Parenting Avoidable if both available
- Joint/ Shared Parenting Good for the child
- Santa Parenting Worst for the child

Maladaptive Parental Gatekeeping – Judge Philip Marcus

Supervised visitation only in cases of violence and sexual abuse

## Parenting Skills for a Business Leader

- Patience
- Communication
- Flexibility
- Resilience
- Empathy
- Leadership
- Life-long Learning

Parenting skills one has and hones can translate directly into the business world

# Merits of Shared Parenting

- Child gets the best of both the worlds
- Good for mothers; father contributing in kind
- Good for fathers; become responsible
- Decrease in Judicial work; parties deciding
- Enhancing the image of the lawyers; client counselling and negotiation for best results

#### Not Yours, Mine, but Ours
#### When No Shared Parenting

• Physical violence

• Sexual abuse

• Unwilling parent

• Psychologically unfit parent

#### Demerits of Joint Custody – Another Perspective

- Tug of War between parents
- Sometimes enhances Parental Alienation
- Does not consider the Mother-Child bond
- Increased viciousness of custody battles
- Viewed as disservice to women
- States Fathers viewed as predators because of GBV

If the child continues with the primary caregiver, she/he may be less hostile

#### Petitioner Status

#### As it should be:

#### As it often is:

- Equal Parent
- Not a visitor
- ✤ Not a guest?

#### Therefore:

- Parenting Time / Contact
   / Access
- Not only 'Visitation Rights'

- Non-custodial Parent
- Absent Parent
- Alienated Parent
- Targeted Parent
- Hated Parent
- Misunderstood Parent

#### Contact Issues

- Absence of any contact
- Interference with contact
- Abduction
- Plans to move away
- Child abuse Order of injunction restraining entry in the house

## 'Birdnesting'

- Child is not shifted home, school, friends, play remain the same
- Parents take turns to stay with the child
- Stability for the child; adjustibility by the parents

May be used for some years until the child grows up to face reality



**Parental alienation** (called Child Protection Issue by mental health experts)

- Mild modifying custody
- Moderate refusing visits
- Extreme denying child info, cutting access/phone/isolation brain washing and tutoring the child

MATRIMONIAL CRUELTY

PSYCHOLOGICAL KIDNAPPING

#### Parental Alienation Syndrome (PAS)

- Destroying half the roots of the child
- Worse than the loss of a parent by death
- Emotional Child Abuse
- Emotional / Mental Cruelty
- Generally *Fatherlessness*

Divided in Matrimony, but united in Parenting

#### How is the Child alienated?

- ≻Create fear (Zoo story)
- ➢Poison ears
- Carrot and stick policy
- ► Isolate the child
- Consequences for loving the targeted parent
- ≻Passive attitude (traumatic)
- Tutor / Prepare for the access 4 days of torture; 2 by indoctrination, 2 by interrogation





**Results of Parental** Alienation

- Serious Psychological Damage
- □ Emotional Child Abuse
- □ Isolation
- □ Fear of Retribution
- Survival Instincts
- Betrayal / Bitterness / hatred
- Delinquency
- Personality Disorder

### Interviewing the child

- Questions for CIL and Judges
- Simple what, where, how, who?
- No questions requiring Yes / No
- No question: Who do you want to live with?
- No promises of secrets
- No threat of disciplinary measures
- School attendance by parents
- Recalling earlier good memories
- Anything the child wishes to talk about

## Inquiries

- Age of the child
- Contact arrangements by Court order or agreement
- Distance between the houses of parents
- Travelling time
- Whether contact willing, reluctant or non-existant
- Duration of problems
- Conduct of child during contact or transfer
- Frequency of contact
- Type of contact emails, phones, meetings, social media
- Need for immediate orders or therapeutic intervention
- Need for orders against leaving the jurisdiction

# Whose right is it anyway ?

Parental rights ?
Parental responsibility.
Section 3 of the Children Act, 1989 in the UK

Allows the non-custodial parent to show a responsible attitude towards child rearing

#### International Illustrations

- Birdnesting in the US
- Parental Responsibility in the UK
- 1 Family; 1 Court in Israel
- Legislation for Care and Contact disputes in Belgium
- Letter to the Child by the Judge in Scotland
- Specialty Court in Massachusetts, US of Judge Linda Fidnik

Family in the future - different, but still Family

### Specialty Court, Mass., US

#### Judge Linda Fidnik

- ✓ Couple assigned a team; family (or legal) consultant, Mental health professionals with speciality of working with children
- $\checkmark$  Series of meetings for agreement on parenting
- $\checkmark$  Talk to the child's teachers
- $\checkmark$  Functional schedule, not a percentage of time
- ✓ Court conference, if required, to develop communication Judge at the table (parents talk about their fears, hopes)
- ✓ Confidential proceedings
- ✓ Binding agreement

Child-focused, friendly, less adversarial, confidential, handholding, but giving out a binding, individual, activized plan

#### New Initiatives

Family Court Bill and National Family Justice Strategy

By '2 Wishes – because not all children get their 1<sup>st</sup> wish'

- Creation of a new dedicated FC within the existing system
- Faster, less adversarial, more efficient, user-friendly,
- Minimizes conflicts and costs
- Best interest of the child
- Active case management and ADR
- Range of support services

Booklet of Child Alienation

By Child Rights Foundation

#### Therefore, what lessons????

# PRIMARY PREVENTION & EARLY INTERVENTION

- Nipping in the bud Early intervention by Courts and Counsellors
- Secondary and Tertiary Intervention
- Advise/Treatment for parent; therapy for child
- Expeditious orders Time of the essence
- Timely reports of compliance of access orders
- Public Awareness

I am the child

You hold in your hand my destiny. You determine whether I shall succeed or fail, Give me the things that make for happiness. Train me that I may be a Blessing to the world.

-Manie Gene Cole Quoted by Justice Hansaria in M.C. Mehta Vs. State of Tamil Nadu 1991 (1) SCC 283

# The Judiciary must Hear those who cannot shout, Listen to those who cannot speak.

